

Allen County Engineer's Office

Quality Based Selection Process



Note: This policy is intended to keep the Allen County Engineer in compliance with Ohio's Design Professional Selection Law (Ohio Revised Code Sections 153.65 through 153.73).

When the need arises for professional design services, the Allen County Engineer will appoint a Consultant Selection Committee, which will follow this quality based selection policy to choose a professional design firm to perform the work.

I. Notification of Work

A. Professional Design Service Contracts Estimated at \$49,999 or Less

As per Ohio Revised Code [§153.71], professional design service contracts estimated at \$49,999 or less will not be announced. Instead, the Consultant Selection Committee shall award these contracts utilizing the Pre-qualified Consultant List [ORC §153.68] as detailed below. However, on a project-by-project basis, the Allen County Engineer reserves the right to use the other methods as per [ORC §153.67] to announce the need for professional design services.

When using the Pre-qualified Consultant List, the Committee shall simply select the firm that is determined to be the most qualified to perform the work. Only those consultants who have a current and active pre-qualification status will be eligible for this selection. Once the firm has been selected, the Allen County Engineer shall move directly into **Contract Negotiations** with the selected firm as set forth under *Item III* below.

In order to obtain and maintain pre-qualified status and thus be eligible for selection, firms must annually submit, in person, updated general qualifications to the Allen County Engineer's Office. *These general qualifications are to be submitted between January 1st and January 31st of each calendar year. On February 1st of each year, our files will be updated and all general qualifications dated prior to January 1st of that same year will be discarded.* As other firms become aware of this policy, general qualification statements will be accepted at any time from any firm. It is the consultant's responsibility to maintain pre-qualified status; no advertisements or notifications will be made.

General Qualifications Requirements

As a minimum, the general qualification statement must contain the following information:

- a) A brief history and location of the firm
- b) Education, licensing and experience/expertise of current staff available for projects
- c) Examples of work, including types of projects completed in the past, with references
- d) Any previous work performed for the Allen County Engineer
- e) Current O.D.O.T. pre-qualification status
- f) Current O.D.O.T. Consultant Evaluation System (CES) score
- g) Proof of liability insurance

At the discretion of the Allen County Engineer, any statement of general qualifications that does not contain all of this information may be rejected.

All general qualifications must be submitted in person to the Allen County Engineer's Office and be a maximum of four (4) pages in length (not including a Letter of Transmittal and Proof of Insurance).

For additional reference, standard company brochures may be submitted separately. These brochures must be bound, less than one-half (½) inch thick and fit into a legal size hanging file folder. No three-ring hard cover notebooks will be accepted.

B. Professional Design Service Contracts Estimated at \$50,000 or More

For professional design services contracts estimated at \$50,000 or more, the Consultant Selection Committee will publicly announce the need for such services. Announcements can be made through any of the following that the Allen County Engineer considers to be appropriate: a professional association, the news media, or through any publications or other public media (including electronic media) [ORC §153.67].

These announcements will be made in a consistent manner and shall be made in advance to allow enough time for qualified professional design firms to submit a letter of interest. Announcements shall include the project information, the qualifications and services required along with any specific instructions for submitting a letter of interest. Submittals will be evaluated using **Consultant Selection**, as set forth under *Item II* below.

II. Consultant Selection

A. Evaluations

The Consultant Selection Committee shall review all letters of interest/statements of qualifications received for the specific project. The Selection Committee may also hold discussions with individual firms to further explore the firms' qualifications, services and various technical approaches that the firms may intend to take.

Following these evaluations, the Consultant Selection Committee shall select and rank no fewer than three (3) firms, which it considers to be the most qualified to provide the required professional design services. If the Selection Committee determines (in writing) that fewer than three (3) qualified firms are available, the Selection Committee shall select and rank those firms.

B. Ranking Firms

On a project-by-project basis, the Consultant Selection Committee will evaluate the selected consultants based upon the "Consultant Selection Rating Form". The scores of each category will be summed for a total score. Firms will be ranked from highest to the lowest total score with the highest scoring firm being the most qualified.

Once firms have been ranked, the Allen County Engineer shall move directly into **Contract Negotiations** with the highest ranked firm as set forth under *Item III* below. The Allen County Engineer shall notify all firms that submitted a letter of interest of the final selection.

III. Contract Negotiations

Once the qualified firm has been selected, the firm will be asked to submit a price proposal for the professional design services required. The Allen County Engineer reserves the right to negotiate with the consultant for a better contract price. Once the engineer and the consultant come to an agreement as to the scope, fee and timeline, the Allen County Engineer will request the consultant to prepare a formal agreement. The Allen County Engineer will then send this agreement along with a recommendation to the Board of Allen County Commissioners for approval and for the execution of the contract.

If the engineer and the consultant cannot come to an agreement as to the scope of work and fee associated with this work, the project engineer must then negotiate these services with the next most qualified firm. This procedure is repeated until an agreement is reached and the contract is awarded.

IV. Exemptions

The Allen County Engineer may directly select consultants for projects that are exempt from the Quality Based Selection process. Exempt projects are as follows:

Any project determined (in writing) by the Allen County Engineer to be an emergency requiring immediate action.

Letter of Interest Form

General Instructions

Each component below requires a thorough response. Where explanations are requested, they must be given in detail. Do not provide information which is not requested in this form. Please reply concisely.

I. Submitting a Letter of Interest

- a) Letters of Interest must contain a Transmittal Letter on your firm's letterhead signed by the contractual officer.
- b) Letters of Interest must meet the following requirements:
 - 1) Provide a minimum font size of 11-point and maintain margins of 1" on all four sides.
 - 2) Page numbers must be centered at the bottom of each page.
 - 3) Use 8½" x 11" bond weight paper only.
 - 4) Bind pages by stapling at the top upper left hand corner. Do not use any other binder system.
 - 5) Do not provide tabbed inserts or other features that may interfere with machine copying.
- c) Submit one (1) original and two (2) hard copies to the Allen County Engineer, 1501 N. Sugar Street, Lima, Ohio 45801.
- d) Letters of Interest must be received at the above location on or before the due date. Responses received after the due date will not be considered.

II. Key Personnel

Indicate key personnel, along with their work experience, who would be assigned to the project. Include any specialist(s) outside the consultant's firm who would be employed for the project.

- a) Project Manager
- b) Assigned Staff

III. Subconsultants

List any items of work which are proposed to be completed by subconsultants.

IV. Workload and Availability

Discuss your firm's workload and your staff's availability in the required skill classes necessary to accomplish the work outlined in your project approach.

V. Consultant's Past Performance

List current O.D.O.T. pre-qualification status, current O.D.O.T. Consultant Evaluation System (CES) score, and discuss your firm's past performance on similar projects.

VI. Project Approach

Explain your method for project development and discuss any important details to be considered during design and construction. In addition, explain any aspect of your method that is unique or innovative, and specify the economic benefits to Allen County if such an approach is utilized. Consider any impact on the efficiency and effectiveness of accomplishing the required work.

VII. Project Advancement Schedule

Considering Allen County's proposed project completion date and the review time needed for project development, provide and discuss your firm's schedule for the various elements of the work to meet the proposed completion date.



Consultant Selection Rating Form

Project: _____

Project Type: _____ PID: _____ Date: _____

Selection Committee Members: _____

Firm #1 Name: _____ Firm #4 Name: _____

Firm #2 Name: _____ Firm #5 Name: _____

Firm #3 Name: _____ Firm #6 Name: _____

Category	Total Value	Scoring Criteria	Firm #1 Score	Firm #2 Score	Firm #3 Score	Firm #4 Score	Firm #5 Score	Firm #6 Score
Management & Team								
Project Manager	10	See Note 1						
Strength/Experience of Assigned Staff including Subconsultants	25	See Note 2						
Firm's Current Workload/ Availability of Personnel	10	See Note 3						
Consultant's Past Performance	30	See Note 4						
Project Approach	25							
Total	100							

Consulting Firm Selected: _____

Signatures of Selection Committee Members: _____

Consultant Selection Rating Form Notes

1. The proposed project manager for each consultant shall be ranked, with the highest ranked project manager receiving the greatest number of points, and lower ranked project managers receiving commensurately lower scores. The rankings and scores should be based on each project manager's experience on similar projects and past performance for the Allen County Engineer's Office and other agencies. The selection committee may contact outside agencies if necessary. Any subfactors identified should be weighed heavily in the differential scoring.

Differential scoring should consider the relative importance of the project manager's role in the success of a given project. The project manager's role in a simple project may be less important than for a complex project, and differential scoring should reflect this, with higher differentials assigned to projects that require a larger role for the project manager.

2. The experience and strength of the assigned staff, including subconsultant staff, should be ranked and scored as noted for Number 1 above, with higher differential scores assigned on more difficult projects. Any subfactors identified in the project notification should be weighed heavily in the differential scoring. As above, other agencies may be contacted.
3. The consultant's workload and availability of qualified personnel, equipment and facilities shall be ranked and scored on a relative, differential scoring type basis. The scoring shall consider quantifiable concerns regarding the ability of a firm (or firms) rated higher in other categories to complete the work with staff members named in the letter of interest.
4. The consultants' past performance on similar projects with the Allen County Engineer's Office shall be ranked and scored on a relative, differential scoring type basis, with the highest ranked consultant receiving a commensurately greater number of points. The differential scoring should consider the complexity of the project and any subfactors identified in the project notification. The selection team may consider ODOT CES performance ratings if available, and consult with other agencies as appropriate. The use of CES ratings shall place emphasis on the specific type of services requested.